

TAYplan Strategic Development Plan Authority

Summary of Unresolved Issues (Schedule 4)

Issue number 1: Vision and Objectives

Contents

1. Summary of Unresolved Issues
2. Copy of actual representations pertinent to this issue (<i>Personal details have been redacted. Full details have been provided to the DPEA separately.</i>) <ul style="list-style-type: none">• All representations include any attachments submitted by the respondent.• Where representations were submitted in hard copy or by email these were entered into TAYplan's online system and all material originally submitted has been attached and appears here with the representation.
3. Library of documents <ul style="list-style-type: none">• All documents and extracts referred to in the representation and/or the Schedule 4 are either contained in the library attached to this Schedule or where over 50 pages within the Core Library (separate folders).

1. Summary of Unresolved Issues

Issue:		
Issue number 001: Vision and Objectives		
Development plan reference:	Page 6: Vision and Objectives	Reporter: [Note: For DPEA use only.]
Body or person(s) submitting a representation raising the issue and representation references		
Seeking a change		
ID Number	Person/Organisation	Representation Reference
548872	Alyth Community Council	PLAN822
548151	Andrew McCafferty for GD Strawson and J Farquharson	PLAN440
443102	Barton Willmore for Scotia Homes	PLAN375
545071	Binn Eco Park	PLAN138
450103	CTC Right to Ride Network	PLAN837
445201	Emac Planning for A & J Stephen Ltd	PLAN679
445201	Emac Planning for A & J Stephen Ltd	PLAN681
548522	Emac Planning for A & J Stephen Ltd/Bett Homes Ltd	PLAN728
548522	Emac Planning for A & J Stephen Ltd/Bett Homes Ltd	PLAN729
445204	Emac Planning for Angus Estates Ltd	PLAN593
548523	Emac Planning for Bett Homes Ltd	PLAN758
548523	Emac Planning for Bett Homes Ltd	PLAN759
445203	Emac Planning for James Keiller Estates Ltd	PLAN710
445203	Emac Planning for James Keiller Estates Ltd	PLAN712
445206	Emac Planning for JG Lang & Son	PLAN534
548383	Emac Planning for L Porter	PLAN543
548360	Emac Planning for M Batchelor (B)	PLAN530
548301	Emac Planning for M Batchelor (K)	PLAN517
445205	Emac Planning for Mr R Watson	PLAN508
548524	Emac Planning for Stewart Milne Homes	PLAN774
548524	Emac Planning for Stewart Milne Homes	PLAN775
548524	Emac Planning for Stewart Milne Homes	PLAN776
438726	Geddes Consulting for Lynch Homes	PLAN629
438726	Geddes Consulting for Lynch Homes	PLAN632
438726	Geddes Consulting for Lynch Homes	PLAN638
445159	Geddes Consulting for Thomson Homes	PLAN883
543112	GS Brown Construction	PLAN83
547268	GVA for David Wilson Homes	PLAN447
548389	Halliday Fraser Munro for Barratt Homes	PLAN579
442882	Homes for Scotland	PLAN213
443979	Lynne Palmer	PLAN161
406092	Mr Ken Russell	PLAN32
337567	Mr Kyffin Roberts	PLAN507
548254	Muirhead, Birkhill and Liff Community Council	PLAN478
344887	Penny Uprichard	PLAN872
548419	Roy de C Chapman	PLAN582

453889	Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council	PLAN916
548506	Ryden for University of St. Andrews	PLAN722
548506	Ryden for University of St. Andrews	PLAN723
548506	Ryden for University of St. Andrews	PLAN724
548506	Ryden for University of St. Andrews	PLAN730
548506	Ryden for University of St. Andrews	PLAN732
444087	Scottish Property Federation	PLAN240
442871	Smiths Gore for Errol Park Estate	PLAN623
442870	Smiths Gore for Mansfield Estates	PLAN540
547750	St. Andrews Preservation Trust	PLAN304
546491	TMS Planning for Champion Homes	PLAN224
345005	TMS Planning for Mr James Thomson	PLAN236
345007	TMS Planning for Mr Simon Wilson	PLAN396
345006	TMS Planning for Mr Tim Esparon	PLAN187
345006	TMS Planning for Mr Tim Esparon	PLAN200
346675	TMS Planning for Muir Homes Ltd	PLAN353
547863	Wallace Planning Limited for National Grid	PLAN351

Support as written

ID Number	Person/Organisation	Representation Reference
419429	Auchterarder and District Community Council	PLAN75
442149	Bidwells for Zurich Assurance Ltd	PLAN660
337727	Colliers International for Gleneagles Hotel	PLAN50
416017	Colliers International for Persimmon Homes Ltd	PLAN37
541486	Colliers International for Taylor Wimpey East Scotland	PLAN60
450103	CTC Right to Ride Network	PLAN835
450103	CTC Right to Ride Network	PLAN836
548948	Hargest Planning Ltd for MacDonald Estates	PLAN854
327210	JWK Properties	PLAN929
263542	Kingsbarns Community Council	PLAN373
444081	Montagu Evans for Montagu Evans	PLAN318
548506	Ms Anne Rennie for University of St. Andrews	PLAN732
547710	NHS Tayside	PLAN295
548506	Ryden for University of St. Andrews	PLAN725
548506	Ryden for University of St. Andrews	PLAN726
548506	Ryden for University of St. Andrews	PLAN727
548506	Ryden for University of St. Andrews	PLAN730
548506	Ryden for University of St. Andrews	PLAN732
442031	Scottish Environment Protection Agency	PLAN169
344848	Scottish Natural Heritage for	PLAN413
548745	Scottish Wildlife Trust Angus and Dundee Members Centre	PLAN805
547388	SEStran Regional Transport Partnership	PLAN271

Provision of the development plan to which the issue relates:

The Vision and Objectives how the region should be in 2032 and what must occur to bring about this change.

SUMMARY OF REPRESENTATIONS SEEKING A CHANGE

GENERAL

Emac Planning for (Angus Estates Ltd (445204); A & J Stephen Ltd – PLAN679 (445201); A & J Stephen Ltd/Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN728 (548522); Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN758 (548523); James Keiller Estates Ltd – PLAN710 (445203); JG Lang & Son (445206); L Porter (548383); M Batchelor (B)(548360); M Batchelor (K)(548301); Mr R Watson (445205) and Stewart Milne Homes (548524) – PLAN774 & PLAN775 (duplicate of PLAN774)) In order to achieve the vision TAYplan should be more ambitious in terms of its strategy for growth.

Penny Uprichard (344887) considers that there is a lack of economic proposals for funding the Proposed Plan's 'visions'.

St. Andrews Preservation Trust (547750) consider that this section of the Proposed Plan does not take account of changes in recent years, including: the significantly changed economic situation; the closure of the Guardbridge Paper Mill (which provides a potential site for the St. Andrews science park or business park); and, the closure of the Leuchars airbase (which offers the chance to review previous decisions not to locate significant new housing in the area because of noise issues, and also allows for the possibility of developing commercial air services).

Wallace Planning Limited for National Grid (547863) seeks adding a new sentence to promote the restoration and regeneration of brownfield sites especially those in need of regeneration e.g. former Gasworks sites. The respondent considers TAYplan should adopt a proactive approach towards promoting viable after-uses for former gas works sites. This approach should be set out in the Strategic Development Plan and be required to be carried forward into the Local Development Plans. Such an approach should recognise that a more sympathetic application of policies is required to ensure the remediation of former gaswork sites.

VISION

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) – PLAN 722 Seek an amendment to the Vision to read "...live, work, **study** and visit...".

SUPPORTING SUSTAINABLE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND IMPROVING REGIONAL IMAGE AND DISTINCTIVENESS OBJECTIVES

A) Economic Strategy

Emac Planning for (Angus Estates Ltd (445204); A & J Stephen Ltd – PLAN681 (445201); A & J Stephen Ltd/Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN729 (548522); Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN759 (548523); James Keiller Estates Ltd – PLAN712 (445203) and Stewart Milne Homes (548524) – PLAN776) request an amendment to the objective starting 'Strengthen the economic base...' by inserting 'business and employment opportunities, including...' to achieve flexibility over the Plan period in accordance with paragraph 45 of Scottish Planning Policy which requires 'Authorities should respond to the diverse needs and locational requirements of different sectors and sizes of businesses and take a flexible approach to ensure that changing

circumstances can be accommodated and new economic opportunities realised.'

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) – PLAN 723 seeks an amendment to the objective "Strengthen the economic base to support..." to acknowledge the further and high education sector including commercialisation and research. There is no specific mention of the economic benefits of both the further and higher education sectors within the TAYplan area.

Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567) and Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889) seek an amendment to the objective "Strengthen the economic base..." to state that "...commercial spin-offs from the higher education and research sector..." as commercialising higher education is considered to mean running education for profit rather than commercial exploitation of appropriate types of research.

Binn Eco Park (545071) seek an amendment to the objective "Strengthen the economic base..." to refer to the low carbon technology sector in addition to the renewable energy sector, recognising it as a major development opportunity supporting other sectors.

Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567) and Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889) seek an amendment to the objective "Strengthen the critical mass of Dundee..." to remove reference to the word 'major' with regard to principal settlements serving as economic drivers, particularly in relation to Tier 3 settlements as Policy 1 seeks a more modest role in the regional economy for these settlements.

Mr Roy de C Chapman (548419) expresses concern that the Proposed Plan looks like a tabletop exercise which appears to be based on the false premise that St Andrews will be "The Economic Driver for the whole of Fife." The future development of tourist facilities in St. Andrews would be welcome, but golf courses in St. Andrews (and in the East Neuk) have reached saturation point and additional courses would have an adverse effect on the landscape without any corresponding gain.

B) Provision of Land for Housing and Employment

Scottish Property Federation (444087) consider that the Proposed Plan does not go far enough in encouraging growth and believe that the Strategic Development Plan should plan for a higher growth scenario and set population targets to encourage significant development.

Barton Willmore for Scotia Homes (443102); GVA for David Wilson Homes (547268); Halliday Fraser Munro for Barratt Homes (548389); Homes for Scotland (442882); Smiths Gore for Errol Park Estate (442871); Smiths Gore for Mansfield Estate (442871); Emac Planning for (Angus Estates Ltd (445204); A & J Stephen Ltd – PLAN679 (445201); A & J Stephen Ltd/Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN728 (548522); Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN758 (548523); James Keiller Estates Ltd – PLAN710 (445203); JG Lang & Son (445206); L Porter (548383); M Batchelor (B)(548360); M Batchelor (K)(548301); Mr R Watson (445205) and Stewart Milne Homes (548524) – PLAN774 & PLAN775 (duplicate of PLAN774)) seek the addition of 'generous' in the objective "Plan for an effective supply of land for housing and employment" in order to ensure there is a sufficient housing land supply available in the short and medium term in accordance with Scottish Planning Policy requirements and to drive economic growth. An increase in the quantity and supply of housing land, it is considered, would aid deliverability in the earlier periods of the Plan and allow smaller, more economically viable sites to come forward pending economic recovery and the ability of strategic sites to come forward. Additionally, all those whom **Emac Planning** represent above, seek the inclusion of a reference to mixed use development in this objective, citing that Paragraph 46 of Scottish Planning Policy identifies that there should be a range and choice of employment sites including opportunities for mixed use development. **Halliday**

Fraser Munro for Barratt Homes (548389) additionally expresses concerns in relation to brownfield sites and promotes a site north east of Monifieth for mixed use development. These issues are addressed in Issue 4 – Policy 1: Location Priorities – Policy 1b, text and general, Issue 13 - Policy 4: Strategic Development Areas – Alternative sites.

Geddes Consulting for Lynch Homes - PLAN629, PLAN632 & PLAN638 (438726) and **Geddes Consulting for Thomson Homes (445159)** seek an amendment to the objective “Plan for an effective supply...” to ensure a minimum of 5 years housing land supply at all times, and employment, serviced or serviceable within 5 years in order to ensure that the concept of effective land supply is in accord with Scottish Planning Policy and can give appropriate guidance to the emerging Local Development Plans.

Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567) and Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889) seek an amendment to the objective “Plan for an effective supply...” to seek particular reference to affordable housing, considering that this is one of the greatest problems facing many places including St. Andrews.

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) – PLAN 724 seek an amendment to the objective “Plan for an effective supply...” to Plan for an effective supply of land for housing and employment appropriate to local demand, highlighting issues of insufficient provision of staff and student accommodation in St. Andrews and consequent impacts on the University of St. Andrews.

Andrew McCafferty for GD Strawson and J Farquharson (548151) seek an amendment to the objective "Plan for an effective supply..." to plan for a supply of land for housing and employment which is based on meeting needs and demand over the lifetime of the Plan. The response also notes support for a higher, more aspirational range of growth to avoid constraining growth.

Mr Ken Russell (406092) seeks an amendment to the objective "Plan for an effective supply..." by adding ‘and Community Facilities’ to acknowledge the whole variety of developments that contribute to a sustainable community.

Emac Planning for (Angus Estates Ltd (445204); A & J Stephen Ltd – PLAN679 (445201); A & J Stephen Ltd/Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN728 (548522); Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN758 (548523); James Keiller Estates Ltd – PLAN710 (445203); JG Lang & Son (445206); L Porter (548383); M Batchelor (B)(548360); M Batchelor (K)(548301); Mr R Watson (445205); Stewart Milne Homes (548524) – PLAN774 & PLAN775 (duplicate of PLAN774)) consider that the Plan relies too heavily on Strategic Development Areas identified previously under Development Plans approved or adopted in a different economic climate, and that the contribution of the existing Strategic Allocations to the supply of housing land required in Development Plan periods preceding the TAYplan should not therefore just simply be rolled forward. Concern is expressed at the deliverability of some of the Strategic Development Areas. The respondents further consider that the Plan should recognise that some of the supply identified by the Strategic Development Areas actually contributes to the period prior to 2012 and logically therefore their entire allocation should not contribute to the Housing Land Requirement identified in the TAYplan.

C) Deliverability

TMS Planning for (Mr Tim Esparon (345006) – PLAN187 & PLAN200 (duplicate of PLAN187); Champion Homes (546491); Mr James Thompson (345005); Mr Simon Wilson (345007) and Muir Homes Ltd (346675)) consider there should be reference to the "provision of a deliverable development strategy in order to meet the underlying needs of the TAYplan

area" added to the diagram. It is imperative that local development plans are required to show deliverability and effectiveness of land allocations.

D) Spatial Strategy

TMS Planning for (Mr Tim Esparon (345006) – PLAN187 & PLAN200 (duplicate of PLAN187); Champion Homes (546491); Mr James Thompson (345005); Mr Simon Wilson (345007) and Muir Homes Ltd (346675)) The objective to "Facilitate appropriate development in rural communities ..." should be altered to state "to promote prosperous and sustainable rural communities in order to support local services and amenities, including the provision of additional housing and related development proportionate to local need, available infrastructure and environmental capacity" in line with the requirements of Scottish Planning Policy.

The above further consider a new objective to "facilitate development outwith principle settlements in order to meet identified local needs" should be added.

E) Other

Lynne Palmer (443979) seeks the removal of the letter 's' at the end of 'town' when referring to the region's towns centres.

ENHANCING THE QUALITY OF PLACE THROUGH BETTER DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES OBJECTIVES

Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567) and Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889) seek an amendment to the objective "Promote and enhance places and landscapes as economic drivers..." to include the word 'appropriate' before 'places and landscapes' as it is not considered possible to simultaneously safeguard a place and exploit it as an economic driver. The respondents consider that the objective should not apply to places safeguarded under Policy 3 of the Proposed Plan. The respondents also seek an amendment to the objective 'Continue to protect the important landscape settings ...' to remove the word 'continue' as for St. Andrews whilst green belt is proposed in a draft Local Plan this is not yet implemented.

GS Brown Construction (543112) express concern that the green belt concept is an anachronism in planning terms and is too blunt and rigid in its application, and that the proposed Perth green belt will rule out small scale infill type developments within the Perth Core zone.

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) PLAN730 highlight that protection of St. Andrews landscape setting through the use of a green belt must be balanced with the need to ensure there is sufficient housing and employment land supply within St. Andrews to allow its planned and measured expansion, thus securing the economic sustainability of the Town.

ENSURING EFFECTIVE RESOURCE MANAGEMENT AND PROMOTING AN ACCESSIBLE, CONNECTED AND NETWORKED REGION OBJECTIVES

Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567) and Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889) seek an amendment to the objective 'Promote transport linkages...' to make reference to bus, rail and cycle path improvements as examples of 'network improvements'. The respondent considers that such improvements would be consistent with TAYplan's support for reducing carbon emissions. The respondents further seek an amendment to the objective 'Ensure that new development makes best use of existing networks...' to add the word 'protect' before 'ecosystems' for clarity.

Muirhead, Birkhill and Liff Community Council (548254) seeks an amendment to the objective 'Promote transport linkages...' to make reference to linking air, bus and rail transport with each other and with the Park and Ride facilities such as Dundee West.

CTC Right to Ride Network (450103) - PLAN837 expresses concern that the objective 'Enhance the condition and connectivity of the networks of green spaces...' could be used to force pedal cyclists off the existing roads infrastructure.

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) - PLAN732 whilst supporting the objective 'Support the switch to a low carbon and zero waste economy' the respondent considers that the plan should consider infrastructure for the creation of a suitable electricity grid to meet community demands to manage renewable energy generation, and consider establishment of more localised waste and resource management facilities.

Alyth Community Council (548872) whilst requesting no specific change, consider that the declaration that the need to fight climate change is central to TAYplan's strategy is strange and that the need to focus on the well-being of all the residents of this area should be central and foremost.

SUMMARY OF REPRESENTATIONS SUPPORTING AS WRITTEN

GENERAL

Bidwells for Zurich Assurance Ltd (442149), JWK Properties for J Khazaka (327210), Scottish Environment Protection Agency (442031), Auchterarder and District Community Council (419429), and SEStran Regional Transport Partnership (547388) show general support for the vision and objectives as outlined.

Colliers International for (Persimmon Homes Ltd (416017), Gleneagles Hotel (337727), Kingsbarns Community Council (263542) and Taylor Wimpey East Scotland (541486) show specific support for the objectives as outlined.

VISION

Scottish Wildlife Trust Angus and Dundee Members Centre (548745) specifically supports the underlying vision of the Proposed Plan.

SUPPORTING SUSTAINABLE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND IMPROVING REGIONAL IMAGE AND DISTINCTIVENESS OBJECTIVES

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) PLAN726/PLAN727/PLAN725, Hargest Planning Ltd (548948), NHS Tayside (547710), Scottish Property Federation (444087) Kingsbarns Community Council (263542) and Montagu Evans (444081) support elements of this objective.

ENHANCING THE QUALITY OF PLACE THROUGH BETTER DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) PLAN730, CTC Right to Ride Network (450103) PLAN836 and Scottish Natural Heritage (344848) support elements of this objective.

ENSURING EFFECTIVE RESOURCE MANAGEMENT AND PROMOTING AN ACCESSIBLE, CONNECTED AND NETWORKED REGION OBJECTIVES

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506), CTC Right to Ride Network (450103) PLAN835), Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) PLAN732 support elements of this objective.

Modifications sought by those submitting representations:

NOTE TO REPORTER 1: The text in italics in this section has been lifted directly from the each individual/organisation's representation with minor typographical errors corrected.

GENERAL

Emac Planning for (Angus Estates Ltd (445204); A & J Stephen Ltd – PLAN679 (445201); A & J Stephen Ltd/Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN728 (548522); Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN758 (548523); James Keiller Estates Ltd – PLAN710 (445203); JG Lang & Son (445206); L Porter (548383); M Batchelor (B)(548360); M Batchelor (K)(548301); Mr R Watson (445205) and Stewart Milne Homes (548524) – PLAN774 & PLAN775 (duplicate of PLAN774)):-

- *The stated vision of the Plan is supported, however, in order to achieve this vision the TAYplan should be more ambitious in terms of its strategy for growth.*

Penny Uprichard (344887)

- *Requests no specific change but considers that there is a lack of economic proposals for funding the Proposed Plan's 'visions'.*

St. Andrews Preservation Trust (547750)

- *Requests no specific change but consider that this section of the Proposed Plan does not take account of changes in recent years, including: the significantly changed economic situation; the closure of the Guardbridge Paper Mill; and, the closure of the Leuchars airbase.*

Wallace Planning Limited for National Grid (547863)

- *Insert new sentence to read: "Promote the restoration and regeneration of brownfield sites especially those in need of regeneration eg former Gasworks sites."*

VISION

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) – PLAN 722:-

- *The vision should be amended as follows:
"By 2032 the TAYplan region will be sustainable, more attractive, competitive and vibrant without creating an unacceptable burden on our planet. The quality of life will make it a place of first choice where more people choose to live, work, **study** and visit and where businesses choose to invest and create jobs".*

SUPPORTING SUSTAINABLE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND IMPROVING REGIONAL IMAGE AND DISTINCTIVENESS OBJECTIVES

A) Economic Strategy

Emac Planning for (Angus Estates Ltd (445204); A & J Stephen Ltd – PLAN681 (445201); A & J Stephen Ltd/Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN729 (548522); Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN759 (548523); James Keiller Estates Ltd – PLAN712 (445203) and Stewart Milne Homes (548524) – PLAN776)

- After "strengthen the economic base to support..." insert "business and employment opportunities, including..."

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) – PLAN 723:-

- Amend Objective (Economic Base) Page 6 to read "Strengthen the economic base to support the renewable energy sector, **the further and high education sector** including commercialisation and research, the region's ports and food research, forestry, life sciences, digital media and tourism.

Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567) and Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889)

- Change "commercialisation of the higher education and research sector" to "commercial spin-offs from the higher education and research sector".

Binn Eco Park (545071):-

- Change Objective that starts..."Strengthen the economic base"...etc by adding after renewable energy "and low carbon technology" sector so it reads...'to support the renewable energy and low carbon technology sector, the regions ports etc..".

Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567) and Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889)

- Change "Strengthen the critical mass of Dundee so that with Perth and other principal settlements they serve as major economic drivers supporting a more competitive, strong and stable economy for the region;" to "Strengthen the critical mass of Dundee so that with Perth and other principal settlements they serve as economic drivers supporting a more competitive, strong and stable economy for the region;".

Mr Roy de C Chapman (548419)

- Whilst requesting no specific change expresses concern additional golf courses in St Andrews (and in the East Neuk) would have a very adverse effect on the landscape without any corresponding gain.

B) Provision of Land for Housing and Employment

Scottish Property Federation (444087)

- The TAYplan's strategy should be more ambitious and plan for a higher population growth.

Barton Willmore for Scotia Homes (443102); GVA for David Wilson Homes (547268); Halliday Fraser Munro for Barratt Homes (548389); Homes for Scotland (442882); Smiths Gore for Errol Park Estate (442871); Smiths Gore for Mansfield Estate (442871); Emac Planning for (Angus Estates Ltd (445204); A & J Stephen Ltd – PLAN679 (445201); A & J Stephen Ltd/Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN728 (548522); Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN758 (548523); James Keiller Estates Ltd – PLAN710 (445203); JG Lang & Son (445206); L

Porter (548383); M Batchelor (B)(548360); M Batchelor (K)(548301); Mr R Watson (445205); and Stewart Milne Homes (548524) – PLAN774 & PLAN775 (duplicate of PLAN774))

- Seek the addition of 'generous' in the objective "Plan for an effective supply of land for housing and employment".
- Substitute "Plan for an effective supply of land for housing and employment" with "Plan for a generous and effective supply of land for housing, employment and mixed use development".

Geddes Consulting for Lynch Homes - PLAN629, PLAN632 & PLAN638 (438726); Geddes Consulting for Thomson Homes (445159)

- Proposed Plan Text: Plan for an effective supply of land for housing and employment.
- Proposed Change: Plan for an effective supply of land for housing, ensuring a minimum of 5 years land supply at all times, and employment, serviced or serviceable within 5 years.

Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567) and Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889)

- Change "Plan for an effective supply of land for housing and employment;" to "Plan for an effective supply of land for housing, particularly affordable housing, and employment;".

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) – PLAN 724

- Amend Objective (Land for Housing and Employment) to "Plan for an effective supply of land for housing and employment appropriate to local demand".

Andrew McCafferty for GD Strawson and J Farquharson (548151)

- Change objective "Plan for an effective supply of land for housing and employment" to read: " Plan for a supply of land for housing and employment which is based on meeting needs and demand over the lifetime of the Plan."

Mr Ken Russell (406092)

- Objective 'Plan for an effective supply of land for housing and employment' Add and Community Facilities.

Emac Planning for (Angus Estates Ltd (445204); A & J Stephen Ltd – PLAN679 (445201); A & J Stephen Ltd/Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN728 (548522); Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN758 (548523); James Keiller Estates Ltd – PLAN710 (445203); JG Lang & Son (445206); L Porter (548383); M Batchelor (B)(548360); M Batchelor (K)(548301); Mr R Watson (445205); and Stewart Milne Homes (548524) – PLAN774 & PLAN775 (duplicate of PLAN774))

- Whilst requesting no specific change express concern that *the contribution of the existing Strategic Allocations to the supply of housing land required in Development Plan periods preceding the TAYplan should not therefore just simply be rolled forward.*
- Whilst requesting no specific change to the Vision and Objectives express concern that *the Plan should recognise that some of the supply identified by the SDA's actually contributes to the period prior to 2012 and logically therefore their entire allocation should not contribute to the Housing Land Requirement identified in the TAYplan.*

C) Deliverability

TMS Planning for (Mr Tim Esparon (345006) – PLAN187 & PLAN200 (duplicate of PLAN187); Campion Homes (546491); Mr James Thompson (345005); Mr Simon Wilson (345007) and Muir Homes Ltd (346675)) :-

- *There should also be reference to the "provision of a deliverable development strategy in order to meet the underlying needs of the TayPlan area" added to the diagram.*

D) Spatial Strategy

TMS Planning for (Mr Tim Esparon (345006) – PLAN187 & PLAN200 (duplicate of PLAN187); Campion Homes (546491); Mr James Thompson (345005); Mr Simon Wilson (345007) and Muir Homes Ltd (346675)):-

- *The diagram contains the objective to "Facilitate appropriate development in rural communities where job and service needs exist". In line with the requirements of Scottish Planning Policy this should be altered to state "to promote prosperous and sustainable rural communities in order to support local services and amenities, including the provision of additional housing and related development proportionate to local need, available infrastructure and environmental capacity".*

E) Other

Lynne Palmer (443979):-

- *Page 6 near the top of page, should be "region's town centres" (remove "s" at end of town).*

TMS Planning for (Mr Tim Esparon (345006) – PLAN187 & PLAN200 (duplicate of PLAN187); Campion Homes (546491); Mr James Thompson (345005); Mr Simon Wilson (345007) and Muir Homes Ltd (346675)):-

- *A new objective to "facilitate development outwith principle settlements in order to meet identified local needs" should be added to the diagram.*

ENHANCING THE QUALITY OF PLACE THROUGH BETTER DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES OBJECTIVES

Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567) and Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889):-

- *Change "Promote and enhance places and landscapes as economic drivers and tourist destinations;" to "Promote and enhance appropriate places and landscapes as economic drivers and tourist destinations."*
- *Change "Continue to protect the important landscape settings and historic cores of St. Andrews and Perth with green belts" to "Protect the important landscape settings and historic cores of St. Andrews and Perth with green belts".*

GS Brown Construction (543112):-

- *Whilst requesting no specific change express concern that the green belt concept is an anachronism in planning terms and is too blunt and rigid in its application, and that the proposed Perth green belt will rule out small scale infill type developments within the Perth Core zone.*

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) PLAN730:-

- Whilst requesting no specific change highlight that protection of St. Andrews landscape setting through the use of a green belt must be balanced with the need to ensure there is sufficient housing and employment land supply within St Andrews to allow its planned and measured expansion, thus securing the economic sustainability of the Town.

ENSURING EFFECTIVE RESOURCE MANAGEMENT AND PROMOTING AN ACCESSIBLE, CONNECTED AND NETWORKED REGION OBJECTIVES

Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567) and Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889):-

- Change "Promote transport linkages, infrastructure improvements and network improvements;" to "Promote transport linkages, infrastructure improvements and rail, bus and cycle path network improvements and extensions;".

Muirhead, Birkhill and Liff Community Council (548254):-

- In the objective 'Promote transport linkages...' include 'In particular the linking of air, bus and rail with each other and with the Park and Ride facilities such as Dundee West'.

Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567) and Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889):-

- Change "Ensure that new development makes best use of existing networks of infrastructure, movement corridors and ecosystems;" to "Ensure that new development is located to make best use of existing networks of infrastructure and movement corridors and to protect ecosystems;".

CTC Right to Ride Network (450103) - PLAN837:-

- Whilst requesting no specific change express concern that the objective 'Enhance the condition and connectivity of the networks of green spaces...' could be used to force pedal cyclists off the existing roads infrastructure.

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) PLAN732

- Whilst supporting the objective 'Support the switch to a low carbon and zero waste economy' the respondent considers that the plan should consider infrastructure for the creation of a suitable electricity grid to meet community demands to manage renewable energy generation, and consider establishment of more localised waste and resource management facilities.

Alyth Community Council (548872)

- Whilst requesting no specific change, consider that the declaration that the need to fight climate change is central to TAYplan's strategy is strange and that the need to focus on the well-being of all the residents of this area should be central and foremost.

Summary of responses (including reasons) by Planning Authority:

RESPONSES TO REPRESENTATIONS SEEKING A CHANGE

GENERAL

Emac Planning for (Angus Estates Ltd (445204); A & J Stephen Ltd – PLAN679 (445201); A & J Stephen Ltd/Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN728 (548522); Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN758 (548523); James Keiller Estates Ltd – PLAN710 (445203); JG Lang & Son (445206); L Porter (548383); M Batchelor (B)(548360); M Batchelor (K)(548301); Mr R Watson (445205) and Stewart Milne Homes (548524) – PLAN774 & PLAN775 (duplicate of

PLAN774))

TAYplan consider the vision to be ambitious. Certainly that is the intention and the message set out in the Foreword. The issue of respondents seeking an increase in the growth of housing land requirement is considered in detail in Schedule 4 (Issue 15: Policy 5: Housing – Policy 5a+b scale and distribution). TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

Penny Uprichard (344887)

TAYplan considers that there are sufficient economic proposals for funding the Proposed Plan's 'visions'. Policies 3 and 4 of the Proposed Plan and their supporting text set out opportunities for economic growth, referring to specific proposals where these are of strategic importance to the region. Policy 8 of the Proposed Plan addresses funding issues, and acknowledges the impact of economic recession. TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

St. Andrews Preservation Trust (547750)

TAYplan considers that the Proposed Plan adequately takes account of changes in recent years. Changes to the economic situation are reflected throughout the Proposed Plan and TAYplan considers the strategy of the Plan, including the Strategic Development Areas to be deliverable. The closure of the Guardbridge Paper Mill and the possibility (at that stage) of the potential impact of the RAF leaving Leuchars were considered in preparing the Plan. The designation of Leuchars/Guardbridge as a Principal Settlement (Tier 3) and prioritisation of the reuse of previously developed land and buildings in Policy 1 of the Proposed Plan will support bringing Guardbridge Paper Mill back into use, as well as offering potential for the growth of Leuchars/Guardbridge more generally. It is noted that the Ministry of Defence announced in July 2011 that Leuchars will become a base for the Army. TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

Wallace Planning Limited for National Grid (547863) TAYplan considers that the Proposed Plan as a whole adequately promotes the restoration and regeneration of brownfield sites. Policy 1: Location Priorities prioritises the reuse of previously developed land and buildings. It is not considered to be appropriate to contain specific reference to former gasworks sites in a Strategic Development Plan, particularly in the Vision and Objectives, although this may be appropriate for inclusion in Local Development Plans. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

VISION

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) – PLAN 722

Whilst it is recognised that the student population in the TAYplan area is significant, the higher and further education establishments are an important part of the economy. It is considered the objective 'strengthen the economic base to support the renewable energy sector, commercialisation of the higher education and research sector, the region's ports and for food research, forestry, life science, digital media and tourism' is adequate. TAYplan's Topic Paper 1: Vision and Objectives states that: 'The Vision statement is about what the outcome will look like and gives rise to a series of objectives' (paragraph 2.1, page 2) (001/SL/Doc46). This is the approach TAYplan have taken in the Proposed Plan and if this was to be changed, there would be a lack of clarity and consistency with the Plan's objectives and the detail included within the Plan's Policies. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

SUPPORTING SUSTAINABLE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND IMPROVING REGIONAL IMAGE AND DISTINCTIVENESS OBJECTIVES

A) Economic Strategy

Emac Planning for (Angus Estates Ltd (445204); A & J Stephen Ltd – PLAN681 (445201); A & J Stephen Ltd/Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN729 (548522); Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN759 (548523); James Keiller Estates Ltd – PLAN712 (445203); Stewart Milne Homes (548524) – PLAN776) and Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) – PLAN 723

TAYplan does not consider it necessary for the objectives of the Proposed Plan to go into this level of detail. The wording sought by the respondents is covered within Policies 1 and 3 of the Proposed Plan and their supporting wording. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567) and Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889)

Regarding the wording 'commercialisation of the higher education and research sector' TAYplan considers that this wording is clarified by Paragraph 4 on Page 14 of the Proposed Plan. With regard to the wording 'major economic drivers when referring to Principal Settlements' TAYplan considers the objective to refer to the Principal Settlements generally, many of which will play an important role in supporting the region's economy. The objective does not state all other Principal Settlements. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

Binn Eco Park (545071)

TAYplan does not consider it necessary for the objectives of the Proposed Plan to go into this level of detail. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

Mr Roy de C Chapman (548419) TAYplan disagree with the respondent's suggestion that the Proposed Plan is a tabletop exercise based on the premise that St. Andrews will be the sole economic driver for the whole of Fife. TAYplan are of the view that there are many economic drivers for Fife, both within and outside the TAYplan area. Proposals for additional golf courses in St. Andrews (and in the East Neuk) will be considered through the Local Development Plan process and planning applications. The Proposed Plan does not identify any specific need for such facilities. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

B) Provision of Land for Housing and Employment

Scottish Property Federation (444087)

TAYplan consider the vision to be ambitious. Certainly that is the intention and the message set out in the Foreword. The issue of respondents seeking an increase in the growth of housing land requirement is considered in detail in Schedule 4 (Issue 15: Policy 5: Housing – Policy 5a+b scale and distribution). TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

Barton Willmore for Scotia Homes (443102); GVA for David Wilson Homes (547268); Halliday Fraser Munro for Barratt Homes (548389); Homes for Scotland (442882); Smiths Gore for Errol Park Estate (442871); Smiths Gore for Mansfield Estate (442871); Emac Planning for (Angus Estates Ltd (445204); A & J Stephen Ltd – PLAN679 (445201); A & J Stephen Ltd/Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN728 (548522); Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN758 (548523); James Keiller Estates Ltd – PLAN710 (445203); JG Lang & Son (445206); L Porter (548383); M Batchelor (B)(548360); M Batchelor (K)(548301); Mr R Watson

(445205); Stewart Milne Homes (548524) – PLAN774 & PLAN775 (duplicate of PLAN774)); Geddes Consulting for Lynch Homes - PLAN629, PLAN632 & PLAN638 (438726) and Geddes Consulting for Thomson Homes (445159); Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889); Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) – PLAN 724; Mr Ken Russell (406092); Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567); Andrew McCafferty for GD Strawson and J Farquharson (548151)

Proposed Plan Policy 5 refers to providing an effective and generous supply of land through Local Development Plans. It is not considered necessary to replicate this in the objectives in the same level of detail. Likewise it would be considered to be going into too much detail to refer to mixed use development, community facilities, affordable housing and local demand in this objective, or provide details of what constitutes an effective supply of land, or to refer to meeting needs and demand over the lifetime of the Plan. Issues contained in these responses are considered in detail in another Schedule 4 (Issue 15: Policy 5: Housing – Policy 5a+b scale and distribution). TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

Emac Planning for (Angus Estates Ltd (445204); A & J Stephen Ltd – PLAN679 (445201); A & J Stephen Ltd/Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN728 (548522); Bett Homes Ltd – PLAN758 (548523); James Keiller Estates Ltd – PLAN710 (445203); JG Lang & Son (445206); L Porter (548383); M Batchelor (B)(548360); M Batchelor (K)(548301); Mr R Watson (445205); Stewart Milne Homes (548524) – PLAN774 & PLAN775 (duplicate of PLAN774))

With regard to the point raised regarding the Strategic Development Areas in relation to housing supply, this point is covered in more detail within Schedule 4 Issue 16: Policy 5: Housing Policy 5a – effectiveness of land. TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

C) Deliverability

TMS Planning for (Mr Tim Esparon (345006) – PLAN187 & PLAN200 (duplicate of PLAN187); Champion Homes (546491); Mr James Thompson (345005); Mr Simon Wilson (345007) and Muir Homes Ltd (346675))

TAYplan consider that the comments raised with regard to deliverability are adequately covered in the Objectives by reference to an effective supply of land. How the Plan, and indeed how Local Development Plans, are delivered is the role of Action Programmes. TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

D) Spatial Strategy

TMS Planning for (Mr Tim Esparon (345006) – PLAN187 & PLAN200 (duplicate of PLAN187); Champion Homes (546491); Mr James Thompson (345005); Mr Simon Wilson (345007) and Muir Homes Ltd (346675))

TAYplan considers the wording proposed by the respondents regarding rural communities to be too detailed to be included as an objective, and considers the existing wording to be appropriate and consistent with Scottish Planning Policy. TAYplan considers that an objective to facilitate development outwith principal settlements is unnecessary and is covered by the objective “Facilitate appropriate development in rural communities...” and Policy 1 of the Proposed Plan. TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

E) Other

Lynne Palmer (443979)

The minor grammatical change requested by the respondent is not considered to make any difference to the meaning or operation of the Plan. TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

ENSURING THE QUALITY OF PLACE THROUGH BETTER DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES OBJECTIVES

Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567) and Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889)

TAYplan consider that there are appropriate safeguards in the Proposed Plan to protect places and landscapes, particularly Policy 2: Shaping better quality places (F) with regard to design issues and Policy 3: Managing TAYplan's Asset's with regard to natural and historic assets and green belt. The use of the word 'continuing' in relation to green belt at St. Andrews is considered to be appropriate in view of the fact that green belt has been allocated in the Finalised draft St. Andrews East Fife Local Plan which is anticipated to be approved in advance of the Strategic Development Plan. TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

GS Brown Construction (543112)

The Vision and Objectives accord with Scottish Planning Policy (Pages 32-33, Paragraphs 159-164) (001/SL/Doc47) with respect to green belt, and need to be considered alongside Policy 3 of the Proposed Plan. Scottish Planning Policy specifies that the strategic development plan "should establish the need for a green belt, identify its broad area and set the policy for future development within it. Local Development Plans should establish the detailed boundaries of the green belt and identify types of development which are appropriate within the green belt. The issues raised by this respondent are addressed more fully in Issue 8 – Policy 3: Managing TAYplan's Assets (green belts). TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) PLAN730:-

The respondent requests no specific change be made. TAYplan acknowledges that green belts should reflect long term settlement strategy and ensure that settlements are able to accommodate planned growth in accordance with Scottish Planning Policy (Page 33 Paragraph 162) (001/SL/Doc48). TAYplan considers that the Proposed Plan provides the appropriate policies and proposals to achieve this. TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

ENSURING EFFECTIVE RESOURCE MANAGEMENT AND PROMOTING AN ACCESSIBLE, CONNECTED AND NETWORKED REGION OBJECTIVES

Mr Kyffin Roberts (337567) and Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889)

The suggested inclusion of additional text regarding bus, rail and cycle path improvements is considered too detailed for the Vision and Objectives of a strategic plan. The change requested for clarity regarding ecosystems is considered to be minor and unlikely to affect the implementation of the Plan's strategy and policies. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

Muirhead, Birkhill and Liff Community Council (548254)

The suggested inclusion of additional text is considered to be implicit in the reference in the objective to 'Promote transport linkages' and is considered too detailed for the Vision and

Objectives of a strategic plan. TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

CTC Right to Ride Network (450103) - PLAN837

The objective referred to highlights that potential uses of green spaces and watercourses may include cycling and walking. It does not suggest that cyclists should use these instead of existing roads infrastructure. The objective 'Promote transport linkages...' promotes improvements that bring about a shift towards non-car travel, including cycling. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) PLAN732

The respondent requests no specific change be made. TAYplan considers that the level of detail referred to by the respondent is not appropriate in the Objectives of the Plan. Policy 6: Energy and Waste/Resource Management Infrastructure of the Proposed Plan provides more detail on these matters and the issues are addressed in Schedule 4 Issue 20 Policy 6: Energy and Waste/Resource Management Infrastructure – Policy 6a+b, text and general (inc. whole policy) and Issue 21 Policy 6: Energy and Waste/Resource Management Infrastructure – Policy 6c). TAYplan does not consider any change to the Vision and Objectives necessary.

Alyth Community Council (548872)

The declaration referred to (in the Foreword of the Proposed Plan) is considered to be wholly appropriate. Scottish Planning Policy (Page 8, Paragraph 41) (001/SL/Doc49) highlights that the need to tackle climate change is a principal challenge of sustainable economic growth. TAYplan also considers that a wide range of other factors relating to the well-being of the region's residents are also fundamental to the strategy of the Proposed Plan. These are reflected in the Objectives on Page 6 of the Proposed Plan.

RESPONSES TO REPRESENTATIONS SUPPORTING AS WRITTEN

Bidwells for Zurich Assurance Ltd (442149), JWK Properties for J Khazaka (327210), Scottish Environment Protection Agency (442031), Auchterarder and District Community Council (419429), SEStran Regional Transport Partnership (547388), Colliers International for (Persimmon Homes Ltd (416017), Gleneagles Hotel (337727), Kingsbarns Community Council (263542), Taylor Wimpey East Scotland (541486), Scottish Wildlife Trust Angus and Dundee Members Centre (548745), Ryden for University of St. Andrews (548506) PLAN725/PLAN726/PLAN727/PLAN730/PLAN732, Hargest Planning Ltd (548948), NHS Tayside (547710), Scottish Property Federation (444087), Kingsbarns Community Council (263542), Montagu Evans (444081), CTC Right to Ride Network (450103) PLAN835/ PLAN836 and Scottish Natural Heritage (344848)

TAYplan welcomes the support for these issues.

OVERALL

TAYplan considers that all of the issues raised do not warrant any change to the Proposed Strategic Development Plan (June, 2011) and propose that the elements dealt with in this Schedule 4 Summary of Unresolved Issues remain as written and unchanged. The Plan's vision and objectives should be concise statements, as set out within Circular 1/2009: Development Planning (001/SL/Doc50). Many of the changes being sought by respondents would make the objectives unnecessarily lengthy. The detail sits within the policies.

Reporter's conclusions:

[Note: For DPEA use only.]

Reporter's recommendations:

[Note: For DPEA use only.]

2. Copy of representations pertinent to this issue

3. Library of documents and extracts (less than 50 pages) referred to within representations and/or this Schedule