

|  |   |   |
|--|---|---|
| <b>Issue (ref and heading):</b>  | 031: POLICY 10: CONNECTING PEOPLE, PLACES AND MARKETS – Rail (inc. Map 10)  |   |
| <b>Development plan reference:</b>   | Policy 10   | <b>Reporter:</b> [Note: For DPEA use only.] |
| <b>Body or person(s) submitting a representation raising the issue (including reference number):</b>   |   |   |
| <b>Seeking a change</b><br>Network Rail (910281)<br>Newburgh Train Station Group (909581)<br>Savills-SmithsGore for Errol Estate (909974)<br>Scottish Government (910172)<br>St Andrews Preservation Trust (910253)<br>Starlink (St Andrews Rail Link) campaign (546345)<br>Strathkinness Community Council (909092)<br>Transform Scotland (910307)  | <b>Supporting as written</b><br>Aberdeen City and Shire SDPA (442583)<br>Cairngorms National Park Authority (910266)<br>Dundee Civic Trust (845127)<br>Ms Kate Donald for Scottish Enterprise (835481)<br>Scottish Environment Protection Agency (835401)<br>Scottish Water (762198)<br>SEStran Regional Transport Partnership (908118)<br>Sustrans (346798)<br>Tactran Regional Transport Partnership (441235) |   |
| <b>Provision of the development plan to which the issue relates:</b>   |   |   |
| <p>The Plan recognises nationally and regionally important infrastructure projects in Map 10. There has been limited change from the infrastructure projects set out in Proposals Map 1 in SDP1. Many but not all are transport infrastructure or service enhancement projects. These transport projects include those identified in the Strategic Transport Projects Review (STPR) (2008) (Doc92) and both Regional Transport Strategies (Doc94) that cover the area. They also include new routes associated with the Strategic Development Areas in this Plan. This has been the result of lengthy discussions between TAYplan officers and Transport Scotland, the 4 Councils and the regional transport partnerships and more detailed information is within the Action Programme (Doc76) (each Map number corresponds to the number in the Action Programme (Doc76)).</p> <p>Of specific note is the proposals for proposed/ aspiration new rail stations. In summary, both Newburgh and Oudenarde remain in the Proposed Plan and Proposed Action Programme as 'proposed' new rail stations of medium priority. Both are within Tactran's RTS Delivery Plan 2008-2023 (Doc95) and the relevant Local Development Plans. TAYplan is committed to considering how these locations can be better connected through improved public transport. The Action Programme sets out the requirement for a STAG appraisal to consider all options for improving the transport system which could include other improvements to public transport.</p> <p>The priority of Wormit rail station has been amended to now be of a low priority in TAYplan's Proposed Action Programme and stated to be an 'aspirational' new rail station in TAYplan's Proposed Plan. TAYplan have made this change through discussions with Transport Scotland and other relevant parties. TAYplan have listened to Transport Scotland and understand the impacts of this rail station on the strategic transport network due to the close proximity to Leuchars. This rail station also has had significantly less background work carried out and visible community backing through consultation responses received.</p> |   |   |

## Planning Authority's summary of the representation(s):

**Note to Reporter:** Scottish Government also submitted PLAN2015\_337 but this was a repeat of PLAN2015\_336.

### Summary of Representations Seeking a change

#### RAIL

##### a) Overall comments

**Transform Scotland (910307) PLAN2015\_464** consider that Policy 10 calls for good connectivity within and through the area yet the Plan fails to make provision for significant rail journey time improvements between the area and adjoining regions but does provide for new road capacity at various points within the region. It is considered that the Plan should make provision for the retention of the existing/remaining trackbeds on the historic routes of the Glenfarg Line and Strathmore Line, providing a direct route from Edinburgh to Perth, stating that this is in accordance with Scottish Planning Policy. It is also considered that prior to reinstatement for rail use; there should also be opportunities for the protected trackbeds to be used for active travel purposes. The respondent provides an example of the Borders railway and explains the process and funding. The respondent considers that the currently under-utilised Perth station could also be transformed into a new Inter-City hub and the catalyst for transport connectivity and urban regeneration.

**Strathkinness Community Council (909092) PLAN2015\_228** consider that there should be reference to a regional transport interchange hub at Leuchars Railway Station included.

##### b) New rail stations

**Scottish Government (910172) PLAN2015\_336** consider that transport appraisals considering potential interventions around the areas identified for rail stations are at the early stages and as such the rationale for any of the stations is yet to be established. The respondent notes that text on the map is not correct as appraisals should be objective-led, not solution-led. Relevant sections of Planning Circular 6/2013 (Doc25) and Scottish Planning Policy (Doc84) are also stated to emphasise that Development Plans should set out ambitious but realistic long-term visions for their areas, indicate where development should happen and where it should not, providing confidence to investors and communities alike and that Development Plans should be consistent with Scottish minister priorities and national policies, providing confidence to stakeholders that the outcomes can be achieved. The respondent has also noted that whilst stated in Scottish Planning Policy (Doc84) and Network Rail guidance, agreement has not been reached with Transport Scotland and Network Rail on the inclusion of the stations at Wormit, Newburgh, Bridge of Earn and the relocation of Invergowrie to Dundee West. Consequently, it is considered that these stations should be removed from Map 10.

**Savills-SmithsGore for Errol Estate (909974) PLAN2015\_527** consider that the reopening of Errol rail station should be added to Map 10 as this would complement the long term vision for the Carse of Gowrie and the Estate land, including any eventual land release, noting benefits of the station reopening and the history of Errol station.

**Starlink (St Andrews Rail Link) campaign (546345) PLAN2015\_508** consider that a new railway and station to St. Andrews should be included as St. Andrew's is an economic generator and better connectivity will benefit the whole surrounding area.

**St Andrews Preservation Trust (910253) PLAN2015\_543** also consider that more emphasis needs to be placed on communities developing integrated transport plans. The respondent also considers that development in Guardbridge should stimulate sufficient demand to link St. Andrews with a light electric rail shuttle service that would also connect with mainline rail services.

**Network Rail (910281) PLAN2015\_568** considers that there should be caution over safeguarding land for a rail halt in Wormit. The respondent considers that the close proximity to Leuchars station may raise issues in achieving appropriate line speeds between the stations. The respondent suggests that the Local Development Plan/ Transport Appraisal considers an alternative option to the new rail station. In considering a new station at Newburgh and Oudenarde, the respondent explains that by adding an additional one or two new stations to a single line may impact on the ability to deliver the new timetable and if not proven feasible alternative policy and practical measures to support new development may have to be considered.

**Newburgh Train Station Group (909581) PLAN2015\_569** considers that Newburgh rail station should be presented as a high priority action within TAYplan. The respondent provides a detailed background to the Newburgh Train Station Group's campaign for the rail station and has referenced a number of reports. The respondent considers the rail station to be supported by the community of Newburgh and also neighbouring Abernethy in addition to tourists and international visitors to the town. The respondent considers Newburgh to be an actual community and a visual arts and crafts hub. The respondent considers that the reopening of Newburgh rail station would give back the networks needed to make Newburgh a viable place to live and work.

## **Summary of Representations Supporting as written**

### **WHOLE POLICY**

**Scottish Water (762198) PLAN2015\_275** support the policy.

**Tactran Regional Transport Partnership (441235) PLAN2015\_365** supports Policy 10 which is consistent with and complements the Regional Transport Strategy.

**Colliers International for Scottish Enterprise (835481) PLAN2015\_371** supports the policy to ensure that Strategic Development Areas are underpinned by the right infrastructure, the direction given to Local Development Plans and that the policy reflects SPP.

**Dundee Civic Trust (845127) PLAN2015\_285** supports the policy, emphasising the connectivity projects that is needed to enhance the region's economic prospects and that it is essential to capitalise on the investments being undertaken in the city in particular in the V&A and waterfront area. The respondent makes specific reference to Dundee infrastructure proposals and the desired direction for these.

**Cairngorms National Park Authority (910266) PLAN2015\_391** supports the strategic infrastructure proposals with the upgrading of the A9 between Perth and Inverness and improvements to the Highland main rail line being of particular significance to the National Park.

**Aberdeen City and Shire SDPA (442583) PLAN2015\_565** supports the proposed A90 upgrade at Dundee and on the rail network at Usan south of Montrose. The respondent considers that while road improvements to increase capacity, speed and reliability of journeys on the A90 at Dundee and on the rail network at Usan south of Montrose are mentioned, these improvements are critical from Aberdeen City and Shire's perspective too and that it is vital that TAYplan and TACTRAN both continue to push coordinated work on this, with Transport Scotland and others, to see these

improvements delivered within the plan period.

**SEStran Regional Transport Partnership (908118) PLAN2015\_35** supports the consideration of freight transport issues.

**Sustrans (346798) PLAN2015\_507** strongly supports safeguarding land for future sustainable transport infrastructure provision, in particular any that is necessary to deliver enhancements to the National Walking and Cycling Network.

**Scottish Environment Protection Agency (835401) PLAN2015\_200** fully supports the proposed strategy for reducing greenhouse gas emissions and improving air quality within the TAYplan area, and considers air quality issues to be a cross boundary problem. Distinguishing that Local Development Plans should aim to minimise carbon and local air quality emissions and recognise the link between the two agendas as well as that plans should improve air quality through sustainable development in their areas is welcomed.

**Modifications sought by those submitting representations:**

**RAIL**

**a) Overall comments**

**Transform Scotland (910307) PLAN2015\_464**

- Propose that in Map 10 and in supporting text, the Plan should make provision for the retention of the existing/remaining trackbeds of the historic routes of the Glenfarg Line and Strathmore Line to provide a direct Edinburgh-Perth route, and that these be specified within Map 10 list of Strategic Infrastructure Projects.

**Strathkinness Community Council (909092) PLAN2015\_228**

- Propose including reference to a regional transport interchange hub at Leuchars Railway Station.

**b) New rail stations**

**Scottish Government (910172) PLAN2015\_336**

- Propose removing reference to proposed or aspirational new railway stations at Bridge of Earn, Newburgh and Wormit and the proposed relocation of Invergowrie rail station to Dundee West on Map 10 of the Proposed Plan.

**Savills-SmithsGore for Errol Estate (909974) PLAN2015\_527**

- Propose an amendment to: Include an additional point on Map 10 for an aspirational re-opened rail station at Errol.

**Starlink (St Andrews Rail Link) campaign (546345) PLAN2015\_508**

- Propose including a railway to St Andrews and station, subject to STAG, as you have for Wormit and Newburgh.

**St Andrews Preservation Trust (910253) PLAN2015\_543**

- Propose that more emphasis needs to be placed on communities developing integrated transport plans, involving all key stakeholders, better provision of safe cycling and walking, better public transport connected with park and ride and park and shop. Car sharing and pooling initiatives should be developed to encourage less car dependency.

**Network Rail (910281) PLAN2015\_568**

- Proposed new station in Wormit: it is suggested that the Local Development Plan/Transport Appraisal considers an alternative option of investigating how new development and policy can support the existing stations such as bus priority

measures, cycle lanes and footpath networks.

- Proposed new station in Newburgh: Between 2014 and 2019, Network Rail is delivering a project which will both increase the number of trains between Inverness and the Central Belt, but also reduce the journey time by around 10 minutes. Adding one or possibly two new stations to a single line may impact on the ability to deliver the new timetable and, as above, if not proven feasible consideration needs to be given to alternative policy and practical measures to support new development.

#### **Newburgh Train Station Group (909581) PLAN2015\_569**

- No specific change stated for the Proposed Plan. Changes specified are for the Proposed Action Programme.

### **Summary of responses (including reasons) by Planning Authority:**

#### **Authority's response to proposed modifications**

##### **RAIL**

##### **a) Overall comments**

#### **Transform Scotland (910307) PLAN2015\_464**

TAYplan consider that provision has been made to consider rail journey time improvements between the area and the adjoining regions. Pages 26-29 of TAYplan's Proposed Action Programme (Doc76) provide detail on the specific national rail improvements proposed through Strategic Transport Projects Review (Doc92). One of the key drivers of each of these projects is to improve journey times and connections throughout the east of Scotland.

The issue of the protection of former railway lines was raised in the Reporter's response to the Perth & Kinross Council Proposed Local Development Plan (2012) (Doc71). While no-one specifically called for the reopening of the former Edinburgh/Perth line, the Reporter summarised that people wished the line protected as a path for walking, cycling etc. while maintaining its availability should it be needed for railway use in the future. PKC accepted this would be desirable and suggested the Reporter could make a recommendation under the community facilities (paths and public access) section of the plan rather than the transport section. The Reporter agreed and Policy CF2 in the Local Development was modified to include protection for disused railway lines, which also meets the requirements of SPP 2014 para 277 (Doc84). Any further consideration of disused railway lines will be through the Local Development Plan (Doc71).

Developing Perth Station as an intercity hub is not identified as a funding priority by TACTRAN in its Regional Transport Strategy Delivery Plan (Doc95) nor is the proposal part of Perth & Kinross Council's Local Development Plan (2012) (Doc71). It is therefore unlikely to come forward within the lifetime of the LDP. It is considered that such a project would need to be identified in Transport Scotland's Strategic Transport Projects Review (Doc92) before it could be considered for inclusion in the Local Development Plan or Strategic Development Plan. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to be necessary.

#### **Strathkinness Community Council (909092) PLAN2015\_228**

TAYplan do not support this change. This project is not a commitment of Transport Scotland nor is it within SEStran's Regional Transport Strategy (Doc88). However, Fife Council are promoting better public transport connections from St Andrews to Leuchars through enhanced bus provision and encourage the use of the train by improving car parking facilities at Leuchars station. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to be necessary.

## **b) New rail stations**

### **Scottish Government (910172) PLAN2015\_336**

TAYplan have worked closely with Transport Scotland, Tactran and Fife Council. Whilst Transport Scotland did not agree, Fife Council and Tactran agreed that the wording for Wormit rail station would be amended to 'aspirational' given the current status of this rail station.

However, it was also agreed that the proposed rail stations at Bridge of Earn, Newburgh and the proposed relocation of Invergowrie rail station would remain a higher priority in the Proposed Action Programme (Doc76) and titled 'proposed' rather than 'aspirational' given their current status. Recent background work has been carried out on each of these which have evidenced the higher priority given to these rail stations.

TAYplan's Proposed Plan Policy 10Dii states that '*Local Development Plans should enhance connectivity of people, places and markets by safeguarding land for future infrastructure provision (including routes) that are identified in the National Planning Framework; Strategic Transport Projects Review or Regional Transport Strategies covering the TAYplan area.*' Each of these proposed / aspirational rail station proposals is included in the currently approved TAYplan Strategic Development Plan proposals map and is in the relevant Local Development Plan. The Local Development Plans have been approved by Scottish Ministers. Each of these rail station proposals is also in the relevant Regional Transport Strategy (Doc94) approved by Scottish Ministers and associated Delivery Plans (Doc95). All proposed stations are important to the long term sustainable strategy of TAYplan.

In addition, Invergowrie Station relocation proposal was identified through Tay Estuary Rail Study (2009) (Doc96) and will be given further consideration following clarification of the future rail timetable taking cognisance of Strategic Transport Projects Review project 23: Rail Improvements between Aberdeen and the Central Belt (Doc92). Bridge of Earn rail station proposal is part of a Masterplan and Section 75 agreement for the Oudenarde Development (031/Extract/3). Bridge of Earn and Newburgh proposals are also subject to ongoing feasibility work by Sustran, Tactran, Fife and Perth & Kinross Councils. Therefore it is appropriate that each of these three stations is identified as proposed. Wormit Station is included in Sustran Regional Transport Strategy Delivery Plan (Doc95) however additional feasibility work has not been undertaken and therefore is included as aspirational.

Whilst currently not within the Scottish Government's Strategic Transport Projects Review (2008) (Doc92), these proposals are an important component of TAYplan's strategy. It is considered appropriate to include these proposals. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to be necessary.

### **Savills-SmithsGore for Errol Estate (909974) PLAN2015\_527**

The re-opening of Errol station does not comply with TAYplan's Proposed Plan Policy 10 as it is not identified in the National Planning Framework (Doc60), Strategic Transport Projects Review (Doc92) or the Regional Transport Strategy (Doc94), nor is it considered to be a location that is essential to support modal shift and reduced carbon emissions and improvements to air quality. An additional number of stops on the main line between Perth-Aberdeen are not supported.

The re-opening of Errol station does not support TAYplan's spatial strategy. TAYplan therefore consider that the re-opening of Errol station should not be added to Map 10. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to be necessary.

**Starlink (St Andrews Rail Link) campaign (546345) PLAN2015\_508 and St Andrews Preservation Trust (910253) PLAN2015\_543**

A rail link to St. Andrews was raised as part of the TAYplan Main Issues Report in 2014. TAYplan's position remains unchanged. TAYplan do not support this proposal.

The proposal is not included in the Proposed FIFEplan (Doc79) and is not currently on Transport Scotland's list of priorities. A full Strategic Transport Appraisal Guidance (STAG) (Doc87) assessment would be needed. The proposed scheme is also severely disruptive to the Old Course Hotel and Links Trust property. The strategy of Fife Council is to promote better public transport connections from St Andrews to Leuchars through enhanced bus provision and encourage use of the train by improving car parking facilities at Leuchars station. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to be necessary.

**Network Rail (910281) PLAN2015\_568**

TAYplan acknowledges the importance of reducing journey time between cities in Scotland. However, TAYplan note that on pages 31-33 of the Proposed Action Programme (Doc76), the emphasis is on undertaking a transport appraisal of each area. The Proposed Action Programme does not just specify the need for a rail study, instead highlighting the need for a wider transport study. This study may indicate that an alternative public transport measure is more appropriate to some areas. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to be necessary.

**Newburgh Train Station Group (909581) PLAN2015\_569**

The Proposed Plan identifies a new rail station at Newburgh as one of several proposals important to the delivery of the Proposed Plan. Work related to this, and the prioritisation given to the project, is detailed in the updated Proposed Action Programme (May 2015 Page 32, Action 15) (Doc76). The priority given to 'undertaking a transport appraisal for the Newburgh area', when compared to the Approved Action Programme (June 2012) (Doc3), has increased to medium priority to be consistent with other new rail stations proposed. The Plan does not deal with prioritisation but gives support to the scheme therefore no change is proposed.

The site is included within SEStrans Regional Transport Strategy Delivery Plan 2008 – 2023 (Doc89) but the proposal is not currently supported by the Strategic Transport Projects Review (Doc92) and Transport Scotland have no commitment towards funding the delivery of a station at this location. Transport Scotland's policy is to promote better utilisation of the existing network as a first choice and, as such, welcomes proposals for Park-and-Choose sites which complement established rail facilities. Therefore TAYplan does not consider any change to be necessary.

**Authority's response to supporting representations**

**WHOLE POLICY**

**Aberdeen City and Shire SDPA (442583) PLAN2015\_565, Cairngorms National Park Authority (910266) PLAN2015\_391, Dundee Civic Trust (845127) PLAN2015\_285, Colliers International for Scottish Enterprise (835481) PLAN2015\_371, Scottish Environment Protection Agency (835401) PLAN2015\_200, Scottish Water (762198) PLAN2015\_275, SEStran (908118) PLAN2015\_35, Sustrans (346798) PLAN2015\_507 and Tactran (441235) PLAN2015\_365**

TAYplan welcome support for Policy 10. TAYplan note that the Proposed Action Programme will be updated annually where the progress on these proposals will be recorded.

**CONCLUSIONS**

TAYplan considers that all of the issues raised do not warrant any change to the Proposed Strategic Development Plan (May, 2015) and propose that the elements dealt with in this Schedule 4 Summary of Unresolved Issues remain as written and unchanged.

TAYplan is satisfied that many of these issues are dealt with appropriately by the Policy as currently written or by supporting elements of Policies 1, 3, 4, 5 and the Proposed Action Programme (Doc76). This is a long term strategic Plan. It is appropriate to identify locations for new transport infrastructure as part of an integrated spatial strategy. This is also important for the sustainable economic growth of the area.

**Reporter's conclusions:**

DPEA use only

**Reporter's recommendations:**

DPEA use only

Committee Version