

TAYplan Strategic Development Plan Authority

Summary of Unresolved Issues (Schedule 4)

Issue Number 11: Managing TAYplan's Assets – Natural & Historic Assets

Contents

1. Summary of Unresolved Issues

2. Copy of actual representations pertinent to this issue (*Personal details have been redacted. Full details have been provided to the DPEA separately.*)

- All representations include any attachments submitted by the respondent.
- Where representations were submitted in hard copy or by email these were entered into TAYplan's online system and all material originally submitted has been attached and appears here with the representation.

3. Library of documents

- All documents and extracts referred to in the representation and/or the Schedule 4 are either contained in the library attached to this Schedule or where over 50 pages within the Core Library (separate folders).

1. Summary of Unresolved Issues

Issue																																			
<p>Issue number 11: Policy 3: Managing TAYplan's Assets – Natural & Historic Assets</p>																																			
<p>Development plan reference:</p>	<p>Page 12: Managing TAYplan's Assets Supporting Text Page 13: Policy 3 Natural and Historic Assets</p>	<p>Reporter: [Note: For DPEA use only.]</p>																																	
Body or person(s) submitting a representation raising the issue and representation references																																			
<p>Seeking a change</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>ID Number</th> <th>Person / Organisation</th> <th>Representation Reference</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>335193</td> <td>Broughty Ferry Community Council</td> <td>PLAN4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>547239</td> <td>Forestry Commission Scotland</td> <td>PLAN268</td> </tr> <tr> <td>331257</td> <td>Mountaineering Council of Scotland</td> <td>PLAN851</td> </tr> <tr> <td>331257</td> <td>Mountaineering Council of Scotland</td> <td>PLAN852</td> </tr> <tr> <td>328962</td> <td>Mr Graham Lang</td> <td>PLAN565</td> </tr> <tr> <td>548408</td> <td>Mrs Marion Lang</td> <td>PLAN570</td> </tr> <tr> <td>538523</td> <td>Perth and Kinross Heritage Trust</td> <td>PLAN20</td> </tr> <tr> <td>545597</td> <td>Professor Charles McKean</td> <td>PLAN148</td> </tr> <tr> <td>331662</td> <td>SportScotland</td> <td>PLAN144</td> </tr> <tr> <td>547750</td> <td>St. Andrews Preservation Trust</td> <td>PLAN849</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>			ID Number	Person / Organisation	Representation Reference	335193	Broughty Ferry Community Council	PLAN4	547239	Forestry Commission Scotland	PLAN268	331257	Mountaineering Council of Scotland	PLAN851	331257	Mountaineering Council of Scotland	PLAN852	328962	Mr Graham Lang	PLAN565	548408	Mrs Marion Lang	PLAN570	538523	Perth and Kinross Heritage Trust	PLAN20	545597	Professor Charles McKean	PLAN148	331662	SportScotland	PLAN144	547750	St. Andrews Preservation Trust	PLAN849
ID Number	Person / Organisation	Representation Reference																																	
335193	Broughty Ferry Community Council	PLAN4																																	
547239	Forestry Commission Scotland	PLAN268																																	
331257	Mountaineering Council of Scotland	PLAN851																																	
331257	Mountaineering Council of Scotland	PLAN852																																	
328962	Mr Graham Lang	PLAN565																																	
548408	Mrs Marion Lang	PLAN570																																	
538523	Perth and Kinross Heritage Trust	PLAN20																																	
545597	Professor Charles McKean	PLAN148																																	
331662	SportScotland	PLAN144																																	
547750	St. Andrews Preservation Trust	PLAN849																																	
<p>Support as written</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>ID Number</th> <th>Person / Organisation</th> <th>Representation Reference</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>423150</td> <td>Braes of the Carse Conservation Group</td> <td>PLAN23</td> </tr> <tr> <td>450585</td> <td>Methven and District Community Council</td> <td>PLAN865</td> </tr> <tr> <td>442031</td> <td>Scottish Environmental Protection Agency</td> <td>PLAN177</td> </tr> <tr> <td>344848</td> <td>Scottish Natural Heritage</td> <td>PLAN418</td> </tr> <tr> <td>344848</td> <td>Scottish Natural Heritage</td> <td>PLAN420</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>			ID Number	Person / Organisation	Representation Reference	423150	Braes of the Carse Conservation Group	PLAN23	450585	Methven and District Community Council	PLAN865	442031	Scottish Environmental Protection Agency	PLAN177	344848	Scottish Natural Heritage	PLAN418	344848	Scottish Natural Heritage	PLAN420															
ID Number	Person / Organisation	Representation Reference																																	
423150	Braes of the Carse Conservation Group	PLAN23																																	
450585	Methven and District Community Council	PLAN865																																	
442031	Scottish Environmental Protection Agency	PLAN177																																	
344848	Scottish Natural Heritage	PLAN418																																	
344848	Scottish Natural Heritage	PLAN420																																	
<p>Provision of the development plan to which the issue relates:</p>	<p>Natural and Historic Assets – this Schedule 4 relates to the three bullet points under the Natural and Historic Assets section of Policy 3.</p>																																		
Planning Authority's summary of the representation(s):																																			
<p>SUMMARY OF REPRESENTATIONS SEEKING A CHANGE</p> <p><i>Broughty Ferry Community Council (335193)</i> consider that high quality bathing waters are economically and aesthetically important, whilst also being important in terms of public health. On this basis, the respondent seek that the quality of the bathing waters in the Tay Estuary and nearby should be mentioned in Policy 3, particularly given the combination of increased</p>																																			

development and the impact of climate change which may have negative impacts on the bathing water quality at Broughty Ferry beach and St. Andrews east sands.

Forestry Commission Scotland (547239) are generally supportive of the Proposed Development Plan as it addresses a number of forestry related matters, however the respondent would like to see something relating specifically to SUDS and green networks. SUDS have been seen as stand alone features in the past, but there is an option to include them as part of the green network. The respondent further considers that green networks should not be seen as an option, but more an opportunity to improve and expand our environment for the enjoyment of all.

Mountaineering Council of Scotland (331257 – PLAN851) whilst welcoming the recognition that the landscape asset is important and should not be adversely affected, the respondent seeks a statement within Policy 3 that the identification of environmentally sensitive areas and important natural and historic assets will be progressed as a matter of urgency. In addition, **Mountaineering Council of Scotland (331257 – PLAN852)** have also indicated that Policy 3 should map valuable landscape assets to ensure a defensible energy infrastructure plan. **Mrs Marion Lang (548408)** has commented that there is little recognition of the importance of landscape to tourism within the Proposed Strategic Development Plan.

Mr Graham Lang (328962) considers that there are few references to the value of landscape within the Proposed Strategic Development Plan. The respondent is also concerned about the current flood of proposals for windfarms which it is considered is endangering large areas of countryside.

Perth and Kinross Heritage Trust (538523) seek an additional paragraph in Policy 3 stating a commitment to protecting all archaeological and historic sites, whilst indicating that as well as stating the protection of all designated sites, this should also include a commitment to protecting all unscheduled archaeological and historic sites which are identified in Local Authorities Sites and Monuments Record or Historic Environment Record.

Professor Charles McKean (545597) has requested a modification to the second bullet point as the current list is a value-free list implying that everything has an equal impact on everybody. If we lessen the identity of Fife burghs – which has happened in Cupar, St. Andrews, and even the coastal burghs – this is done at our tourist peril.

SportScotland (331662) has requested that an additional site of importance for sport and recreation should be added to this current list of sites within the second bullet as it is considered that the TAYplan area has a range of important sites for outdoor sport and recreation including hills, rivers, beaches, mountain bike trails, coastal footpaths and whitewater rivers. These areas should be protected from development whilst opportunities to access them should also be provided from new development.

St. Andrews Preservation Trust (547750) have commented that TAYplan needs to play its part in preventing global warming effects which would reduce the need to introduce the mitigation measures specified within the Natural and Historic Assets section of Policy 3.

SUMMARY OF REPRESENTATIONS SUPPORTING AS WRITTEN

Scottish Natural Heritage (344848 – PLAN418) support paragraphs 2 and 7 on Page 12, in particular the references regarding the need to address climate change and the associated emphasis on building-in mitigation and adaptation to climate change.

Scottish Natural Heritage (344848 – PLAN420), Braes of the Carse Conservation Group (423150), Methven and District Community Council (450585) and Scottish Environmental Protection Agency (442031) support the three bullet points under the Natural and Historic Assets section of Policy 3, particularly the references regarding the protection and enhancement of designated sites, habitats, landscapes and networks of green space and safeguarding the undeveloped coastline.

Modifications sought by those submitting representations:

NOTE TO REPORTER: The text in italics in this section has been lifted directly from each individual/organisation's representation with minor typographical errors corrected.

Broughty Ferry Community Council (335193):-

- *An important TAYplan asset, and which is not mentioned, is the quality of the bathing waters in the Tay Estuary and nearby. This issue should be mentioned and given a higher profile.*

Forestry Commission Scotland (547239):-

- *Would like to see aspects of green networks etc expanded upon. Useful to include something stating that 'The principles of the Central Scotland Green Network' will be adopted for Tayplan.*

Mountaineering Council of Scotland (331257 – PLAN851):-

- No specific change identified, although considers that a statement should be included within Policy 3 *that the identification of environmentally sensitive areas and important natural and historic assets will be progressed as a matter of urgency.*

Mountaineering Council of Scotland (331257 – PLAN852):-

- No specific change identified, although indicate that Policy 3 should map valuable landscape assets to ensure a defensible energy infrastructure plan.

Mrs Marion Lang (548408):-

- No specific change identified, although is concerned that there is little recognition of the importance of landscape to tourism within the Proposed Strategic Development Plan.

Mr Graham Lang (328962):-

- *Policy 4 - there are few references to the value of landscape. The current flood of proposals for windfarms is endangering large areas of countryside.*

Perth and Kinross Heritage Trust (538523):-

- *In the section: Policy 3 - Managing TAYplan's Assets. Under the heading Natural and Historic Assets, there is no mention of the historic environment. This section should include a paragraph stating a commitment to protecting all archaeological and historical sites. As well as stating the protection of all designated sites this should also include a stated commitment to protecting all unscheduled archaeological and historical sites as identified in the relevant local authorities Sites and Monuments Record or Historic Environment Record.*

Professor Charles McKean (545597):-

- add, bullet-point two under 'understanding and respecting': Add after 'landscapes' the words *'so crucial to the identity of place and the tourist experience of it'.*

SportScotland (331662):-

- SportScotland wishes to see sites of importance for sport and recreation in the outdoors added to the list of sites in the second bullet point.

St Andrews Preservation Trust (547750):-

- Have indicated that TAYplan needs to play its part in preventing global warming effects which would reduce the need to introduce the mitigation measures specified within the Natural and Historic Assets section of Policy 3.

Summary of responses (including reasons) by Planning Authority:

RESPONSES TO REPRESENTATIONS SEEKING A CHANGE

Broughty Ferry Community Council (335193):- Although the comments in relation to bathing water quality are noted, particularly in relation to beaches at Broughty Ferry and St. Andrews, TAYplan do not consider that a specific reference is required in Policy 3 (Natural and Historic Assets). The issue of water quality and population and health was assessed within the Strategic Environmental Assessment (Pages 54-56 and Pages 67-70) (CL/Doc41). The purpose of Strategic Environmental Assessment is to ensure that aspects of the environment, such as plants and animals, water quality, historic features, and human health are considered whilst a plan is being prepared in order for it to be modified to avoid or limit harmful environmental effects whilst promoting or increasing positive environmental effects. The Strategic Environmental Assessment also promotes transparency in the development of plans through the involvement of key stakeholders. The key consultation authorities, Historic Scotland, Scottish Environmental Protection Agency and Scottish Natural Heritage have already considered and endorsed TAYplan's Environmental Report (April 2010) without further modification. The latter two key agencies are supporting Policy 3 as it stands.

Forestry Commission Scotland (547239):- The level of detail provided in Policy 3 is appropriate for a strategic planning policy document. Further detail on Sustainable Urban Drainage Systems in-particular is an issue which will be considered within Local Development Plans or during the planning application process. The Proposed Action Programme (CL/Doc37) identifies the preparation of a greenspace strategy (Page 33). The scope of this does not require to be detailed in the Proposed Plan. This will be taken forward in partnership with the key agencies, including the Forestry Commission in preparation for the second Strategic Development Plan.

Mountaineering Council of Scotland (331257 – PLAN851); Mountaineering Council of Scotland (331257 – PLAN 852); Mrs Marion Lang (548408); Mr Graham Lang (328962; and); and Professor Charles McKean (545597):- TAYplan considers that the level of detail in Policy 3 is appropriate for a strategic planning policy document. Policy 3, bullet point two, specifies landscapes as an important consideration in the assessment of development suitability. Further detail on landscapes is an issue which will be considered within Local Development Plans or during the planning application process.

SportScotland (331662):- TAYplan acknowledge the importance of access to sites for outdoor sport and recreation, however the inclusion of a specific reference to such sites is not required. Policy 2: Shaping Better Quality Places (Proposed Plan, Page 11, Part F) brings out further information on access in general and more specifically on integrating networks. There is no need to replicate this information within Policy 3.

St. Andrews Preservation Trust (547750):- Topic Paper 3: Resources and Climate Change (June 2011) (Page 11, Paragraph 5.15) (CL/Doc32) considers that applying a blanket ban on development in order to safeguard natural and historic assets would be impractical given the

important role these assets play in place shaping and the region's social, economic and environmental future. Policy 3 therefore safeguards natural and historic assets and development will only be permitted where it would not adversely impact upon but preferably enhance these assets. This recognises that some development can be appropriate and bring advantages that improve the quality of such sensitive areas (Topic Paper 3: Resources and Climate Change (June 2011) (Page 18, Paragraph 7.13) (CL/Doc32).

In relation to 'global warming', the Proposed Plan's Vision seeks to switch to a low carbon and zero waste economy by providing for appropriate infrastructure and improvements in the resilience to climate change and other potential risks. In addition, the Proposed Plan's Vision also seeks to promote a shift towards non-car travel, support cycling and walking, ensuring new development makes best use of existing networks and infrastructure whilst design-in at the outset to achieve high resource efficiency standards. TAYplan is clearly committed to ensuring global warming effects are reduced within the Proposed Plan as specified in Scottish Planning Policy (Pages 8-9, Paragraphs 41-44) (CL/Doc2) and Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009(CL/Doc13). TAYplan disagrees with the comments provided by the respondent and considers that no further detail is required.

RESPONSE TO REPRESENTATIONS SUPPORTING AS WRITTEN

TAYplan welcomes the support for these issues.

CONCLUSION

TAYplan considers that the issues raised does not warrant any change to the Proposed Strategic Development Plan (June, 2011) and propose that the elements dealt with in this Schedule 4 Summary of Unresolved Issues remain as written and unchanged. Policy 3 (Natural and Historic Assets) has been developed working in partnership with the key agencies. Of these Key Agencies, only **Forestry Commission Scotland (547239)** are seeking a minor change to the policy, whilst others are explicitly supporting it. The Policy is consistent with Scottish Planning Policy. Therefore, a change to Policy 3 could undermine this approach which has ensured the exact policy wording is in agreement with the Key Agencies.

Reporter's conclusions:
[Note: For DPEA use only.]
Reporter's recommendations:
[Note: For DPEA use only.]

2. Copy of representations pertinent to this issue

3. Library of documents and extracts (less than 50 pages) referred to within representations and/or this Schedule