

TAYplan Strategic Development Plan Authority

Summary of Unresolved Issues (Schedule 4)

Issue 22 Policy 7 Town Centres

Contents

1. Summary of Unresolved Issues

2. Copy of actual representations pertinent to this issue (*Personal details have been redacted. Full details have been provided to the DPEA separately.*)

- All representations include any attachments submitted by the respondent.
- Where representations were submitted in hard copy or by email these were entered into TAYplan's online system and all material originally submitted has been attached and appears here with the representation.

3. Library of documents

- All documents and extracts referred to in the representation and/or the Schedule 4 are either contained in the library attached to this Schedule or where over 50 pages within the Core Library (separate folders).

1. Summary of Unresolved Issues

Issue		
22 Policy 7 Town Centres		
Development plan reference:	Page 20 Supporting Text & Page 21: Policy 7 Town Centres	Reporter : [Note: For DPEA use only.]
Body or person(s) submitting a representation raising the issue		
Representation ref(s)		
Seeking a change		
ID Number	Person/Organisation	Representation Reference
450613	Councillor Barnacle	PLAN818
450103	CTC Right to Ride Network	PLAN841
548901	Dawn Developments Ltd	PLAN828
548525	Dr Peter Symon	PLAN902
445204	Emac Planning for Angus Estates Ltd	PLAN642
548159	GVA Grimley for Land Securities	PLAN464
546838	Kinross-shire Civic Trust	PLAN497
443979	Lynne Palmer	PLAN154
343111	Montagu Evans LLP for Wallace Land Investment Management	PLAN332
548430	Muir Smith Evans for EPF Dundee Retail Park s.a.r.l	PLAN596
548416	Muir Smith Evans for Episo Boxes LP	PLAN595
444087	Scottish Property Federation	PLAN252
344887	Penelope Uprichard	PLAN881
453889	Royal Burgh of St Andrews Community Council	PLAN927
547750	St. Andrews Preservation Trust	PLAN846
346698	Theatres Trust	PLAN824
547863	Wallace Planning Ltd for National Grid	PLAN309
Support as written		
ID Number	Person/Organisation	Representation Reference
419429	Auchterarder & District Community Council	PLAN110
335193	Broughty Ferry Community Council	PLAN11
441235	Tactran Regional Transport Partnership	PLAN124
Provision of the development plan to which the issue relates:	Policy 7: Town Centres sets out the Retail Hierarchy of city/town centres within the TAYplan area to guide where future retail investment should be located to help ensure the vitality and viability of the centres are protected and enhanced.	

Planning Authority's summary of the representation(s):

SUMMARY OF REPRESENTATIONS SEEKING A CHANGE

RETAIL HIERARCHY POLICY 7 TOWN CENTRES

GVA Grimley Limited for Land Securities (548159): Supports Dundee's position in the Retail Hierarchy but does recommend that Policy 7 should be expanded to include a more balanced and realistic network of retail centres as Policy 7 only refers to city and town centres while Scottish Planning Policy indicates that a network of centres with the role of each centre should be identified in Development Plans and can take the form of a hierarchy. They consider the Retail Hierarchy on page 21 of the Proposed Plan is inadequate as it fails to appreciate the role that commercial centres have on the economy of the city region. Scottish Planning Policy supports investment to maintain and improve commercial centres as part of the network and where it will not undermine the city/town centre. It therefore seeks that the retail hierarchy on page 21 of the Proposed Plan is expanded to include the main retail commercial centres within the TAYplan area. They are as follows: Kingsway West Retail Park; Kingsway East Retail Park, Gallagher's Retail Park and St Catherine's Retail Park. They also recommend that the Strategic Development Plan further highlights the significant role that retail has on the economic competitiveness of the TAYplan area.

Lynne Palmer (443979): Considers that the Retail Hierarchy on Page 21 of the Proposed Plan will automatically disadvantage Perth because it will always be in the shadows of Dundee. Because of the hierarchy smaller towns are immediately disadvantaged.

Muir Smith Evans for EPF Dundee Retail Park s.a.r.l (548430) and Muir Smith Evans for Episo Boxes LP (548416): Muir Smith Evans for EPF Dundee Retail Park s.a.r.l (548430): Considers that the supporting text on Page 20 should reflect the important locational differences of both Gallagher's Retail Park in Dundee and St Catherine's Retail Park in Perth while **Muir Smith Evans for Episo Boxes LP (548430)** highlights the locational importance of St Catherine's Retail Park in comparison to other retail parks within the TAYplan area as they are both located immediately adjacent to the city centres and will therefore act as a supportive and complimentary role to the respective city centre. They should as a result of this not be considered to be equivalent to other out of centre retail parks such as Kingsway West and Kingsway East in Dundee. **Muir Smith Evans for Episo Boxes LP (548430)** considers there to be an argument for St Catherine's Retail Park to be included in the town centre boundary as the abandoned Draft Perth Area Local Plan (2005) indicated an intention to do this.

Wallace Planning Ltd for National Grid (547863): Recommends that a footnote is added to Table 2 on Page 21 to read "The terminology used in this table reflects the principles of the Retail Sequential Approach set out in Scottish Planning Policy (2010). The term "Regional Centre" reflects the pre-eminent status of Dundee City Centre above all other centres in the Hierarchy of Comparison Centres." This footnote is considered necessary to confirm the use of different terminology from the SPP in Table 2, Hierarchy as Scottish Planning Policy makes no mention of the terms Regional Centre, Sub-regional Centre and City Centre.

SEQUENTIAL PROCESS POLICY 7 TOWN CENTRES

GVA Grimley Limited for Land Securities (548159); Montagu Evans LLP for Wallace Land Investment Management (343111) and The Scottish Property Federation (444087): All recommend that the supporting text on Page 20 should highlight the need for Local Authorities and their Local Development Plans to be more dynamic and flexible so they can react to changing retail trends especially in relation to proposals outwith the primary shopping area.

They consider that the sequential approach advocated in Scottish Planning Policy may provide alternative locations outwith town centres and could be considered appropriate depending on local circumstance. Also, some forms of economic development with an element of retail may also be appropriate and sustainable outwith town centres.

The Scottish Property Federation (444087): Considers Perth City Centre to be constrained with no opportunity for significant foodstore development. It considers that the Strategic Development Area at West/North West Perth provides an opportunity to allocate a site for retail development.

SUPPORTING TEXT, POLICY & GENERAL ISSUES POLICY 7 TOWN CENTRES

Councillor Barnacle (450613), Kinross-shire Civic Trust (546838) and Penelope Uprichard (344887): Are respectively concerned with the condition of Kinross town centre and St. Andrews town centre. **Councillor Barnacle (450613) and Kinross-shire Civic Trust (546838)** request that the 1994-1995 Kinross Development Plan is recognised by TAYplan as Kinross town centre has deteriorated in recent years despite the work/studies carried out in the mid 1990's but has not been acted upon. **Penelope Uprichard (344887)** considers that St. Andrews town centre is in poor condition and does not receive its share of income from Fife Council for the 600,000 visitors it attracts annually.

CTC Right to Ride Network (450103): Recommend a modal shift to non car uses should be encouraged while **Dr Peter Symon (548525)** considers that greater mention of non retail uses and civic identity should be made in the strategy for town centres, especially for Perth.

Dawn Developments Ltd (548901); Wallace Planning Ltd for National Grid (547863) and Emac Planning for Angus Estates Ltd (445204): All promote sites/developments for retail development. **Dawn Developments Ltd (548901)** recommends that Angus Gateway north of Monifieth is recognised as a commercial centre as it is similar to St Catherine's Retail Park and Gallagher's Retail Park etc. **Wallace Planning Ltd for National Grid (547863)** Promotes the gas holder site next to Gallagher's Retail Park in Dundee for future retail development as the TAYplan Retail Framework (2009) supports the site and identifies that there capacity for further retail development in the city. **Emac Planning for Angus Estates Ltd (445204):** Recommends that the employment land allocation at North East Carnoustie should be allocated as a Strategic Development Area to support the demand for it to be a mixed use development including convenience retail.

Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889): Consider that the creation of more local centres will help reduce travel and carbon footprints. They recommend that the second sentence of Paragraph 4 of the supporting text on page 20 is replaced with "*it is important to encourage their creation and to protect and enhance their vitality and viability.*"

St. Andrews Preservation Trust (547750) and Theatres Trust (346698): Both comment that the supporting text on page 20 does not mention non retail uses within town centres such as residential or evening/night time economy. There is value in having a mixed use town centre and a policy supporting evening/night time uses in town centres should be promoted.

SUMMARY OF REPRESENTATIONS SUPPORTING AS WRITTEN

Auchterarder & District Community Council (419429), Broughty Ferry Community Council (335193) and Tactran Regional Transport Partnership (441235): all support the Policy 7 and in particular the proposed retail hierarchy. This support is noted.

Modifications sought by those submitting representations:

NOTE TO REPORTER: The text in italics in this section has been lifted directly from each individual/organisation's representation with minor typographical errors corrected.

RETAIL HIERARCHY

GVA Grimley Limited for Land Securities (548159): Retail Hierarchy on page 21 should be expanded to include the main retail commercial centres within the TAYplan area.

Lynne Palmer (443979): Table 2 (Retail Hierarchy) on Page 21 of the Proposed Plan should have Perth at the same status as Dundee.

Muir Smith Evans for EPF Dundee Retail Park s.a.r.l (548430) and Muir Smith Evans for Episo Boxes LP (548416): The supporting text on Page 20 should reflect the important locational differences of Gallagher's Retail Park in Dundee and St Catherine's Retail Park in Perth in comparison to other retail parks within the TAYplan area.

Wallace Planning Ltd for National Grid (547863): A footnote should be added to Table 2 on Page 21 to read "*The terminology used in this table reflects the principles of the Retail Sequential Approach set out in Scottish Planning Policy (2010). The term "Regional Centre" reflects the pre-eminent status of Dundee City Centre above all other centres in the Hierarchy of Comparison Centres.*"

SEQUENTIAL PROCESS

GVA Grimley Limited for Land Securities (548159) and The Scottish Property Federation (444087): TAYplan should encourage Local Development Plans to be more dynamic and flexible in relation to retail proposals outwith the primary shopping area.

SUPPORTING TEXT, POLICY & GENERAL ISSUES

Councillor Barnacle (450613) and Kinross-shire Civic Trust (546838): request that the 1994-1995 Kinross Development Plan is recognised by TAYplan.

CTC Right to Ride Network (450103): Amend the second last line of Paragraph 4 of the supporting text on Page 20 to include "*especially by car*" and "*reduces the need to travel.*"

Dr Peter Symon (548525): Greater mention of non retail uses and civic identity should be made in the strategy for town centres.

Dawn Developments Ltd (548901): Angus Gateway to be recognised as a commercial centre.

Emac Planning for Angus Estates Ltd (445204): The employment site at north east Carnoustie should be allocated as a Strategic Development Area to allow mixed use including convenience retail.

Wallace Planning Ltd for National Grid (547863): Gas holder site should be allocated for future retail development.

Royal Burgh of St. Andrews Community Council (453889): The second sentence of Paragraph 4 of the supporting text on page 20 should be replaced with "*it is important to*

encourage their creation and to protect and enhance their vitality and viability."

Theatres Trust (346698): Recommends a policy supporting evening/night time uses in town centres should be promoted.

RESPONSES TO REPRESENTATIONS SEEKING A CHANGE

RETAIL HIERARCHY

GVA Grimley Limited for Land Securities (548159): It is considered there is no requirement to amend the Retail Hierarchy on Page 21 to include Commercial Centres as both the Proposed Plan (Page 21) and TAYplan's Topic Paper 5 'Town Centres'- June 2011 (Paragraph 7.5) (022/SL/Doc19) clearly states that it will be the role of the Local Development Plan to identify what Scottish Planning Policy refer to as 'other service centres' including commercial centres. These centres should sit below the regional retail hierarchy and allow the local authorities to consider the specific role and function of these centres.

Lynne Palmer (443979): TAYplan's Topic Paper 5 'Town Centres'- June 2011 page 6 (022/SL/Doc20) identifies that Perth City Centre is not of the same scale nor does it provide the same level of function or national retailer representation as Dundee City Centre. On this basis it is considered to not be of the same status as Dundee in terms of the retail hierarchy.

Muir Smith Evans for EPF Dundee Retail Park s.a.r.l (548430) and Muir Smith Evans for Episo Boxes LP (548416): As stated in both in both the Proposed Plan (Page 21) and TAYplan's Topic Paper 5 'Town Centres' (Paragraph 7.5) (022/SL/Doc19) it will not be the role of the Strategic Development Plan to clarify the role and function of any of the commercial centres within the TAYplan region as they sit below the regional hierarchy. It clearly states that it will be the role of the Local Development Plan/Local Authority to consider the specific role and function of its commercial centres.

Scottish Planning Policy (Paragraph 53) (022/SL/Doc21) promotes that Development Plans should identify a network of centres and depending on circumstances this could include town centres and commercial/local centres. It is considered the circumstance of a Strategic Development Plan that focuses on regional cross boundary issues is too high a level to be required to identify a network of centres that sit below that of city/town centres within its region. It is considered that it is the role of Local Development Plans to identify the commercial and local centres that help contribute to the retail function of the respective city/town.

Wallace Planning Ltd for National Grid (547863): It is considered that the recommended footnote is not required as Scottish Planning Policy (Paragraphs 53 to 56 and 62 to 65) (022/SL/Doc22 and 022/SL/Doc23) does not prevent the use of such terminology as "Regional Centre" being used for Dundee City Centre in the Retail Hierarchy on Page 21 and therefore no explanation is required.

SEQUENTIAL PROCESS

GVA Grimley Limited for Land Securities (548159) and The Scottish Property Federation (444087): Local Development Plans are already required to adhere to the provisions of Scottish Planning Policy and in particular the Sequential Approach set out at Paragraphs 62 to 65 (022/SL/Doc23) which promotes flexibility and realism to ensure that different types of retail and commercial uses are in the most appropriate locations. According to Paragraph 63 of Scottish Planning Policy, Local Development Plans already have the ability to indicate whether retail/commercial developments outwith existing centres may be appropriate and can identify such locations.

SUPPORTING TEXT, POLICY & GENERAL ISSUES

Councillor Barnacle (450613) and **Kinross-shire Civic Trust (546838)**: The 1994-1995 Kinross Development Plan is now considered to be out of date and any future studies should fall under the remit of the Local Authority as redevelopment of Kinross town centre is considered to be a more local issue rather than a strategic one.

CTC Right to Ride Network (450103): consider the phrase 'reduces the need to travel' encompasses all modes of motorised transport and there is no requirement to specifically mention the car.

Dr Peter Symon (548525): The importance of other town centre uses is recognised in the supporting text at the end of Paragraph 5 on Page 20 of the Proposed Plan.

Dawn Developments Ltd (548901); Emac Planning for Angus Estates Ltd (445204) and **Wallace Planning Ltd for National Grid (547863)**: It is not the role of a Strategic Development Plan to promote individual sites. This is a role for Local Authorities in their respective Local Development Plans.

Royal Burgh of St Andrew's Community Council (453889): It is not the role of a Strategic Development Plan to identify new local centres. This is a role for Local Authorities and their Local Development Plans whether to consider allocating/zoning new local centres.

Theatres Trust (346698): Such a policy is not considered to be strategic and Scottish Planning Policy (Paragraph 58) (022/SL/Doc12) does not require such a policy and just states that the "*evening economy should be encouraged and managed in appropriate centres to ensure life and activity outwith usual retail hours.*" If there is to be policy in relation to evening/night time economy within city/town centres it is for Local Development Plans to consider.

RESPONSE TO REPRESENTATIONS SUPPORTING AS WRITTEN

TAYplan notes and welcomes the support for these issues.

CONCLUSION

Policy 7 is consistent with Scottish Planning Policy (2010) on town centres and retailing especially in terms of the proposed retail hierarchy and promotion of the sequential approach. A number of the issues raised are considered not to be strategic in nature and it is for Local Development Plans to deal with. TAYplan considers that the issues raised does not warrant any change to the Proposed Strategic Development Plan (June, 2011) and propose that the elements dealt with in this Schedule 4 Summary of Unresolved Issues remain as written and unchanged.

Reporter's conclusions:

[Note: For DPEA use only.]

Reporter's recommendations:

[Note: For DPEA use only.]

2. Copy of representations pertinent to this issue

3. Library of documents and extracts (less than 50 pages) referred to within representations and/or this Schedule